जो हमें सम्मान प्रदान किया है, उसके लिए हम सारे देश के आभारी है। साथ ही साथ हमें इस बात का भी गर्व है कि हमारी सेक्रेटरी जनरल साहिबा श्रीमती रमा देवी आज ही हम से विदाई ले कर, यहां से रवाना हो कर कल अपने नये पद का कार्यभार संभालेंगी। मुझे आज के दिन एक और बात की भी खुशी है कि प्रधानमंत्री जी ने श्रीमती रमा देवी को राज्यपाल के रूप में नियुक्त कर के जो वीमेन इंपावरमेंट की अगुवाई की है, इसके लिए हम सभी महिलाएं उनकी आभारी हैं। इसके साथ-साथ मैं अपनी ओर से और सदन की ओर से श्रीमती रमा देवी के नये कार्य के लिए कामना करती हूं कि वह काफी यशस्वी और प्रिय राज्यपाल रहें और सही मायने में हिमाचल प्रदेश की सेवा करें। इसके साथ मैं अपने आप की आप से संबद्ध करती हूं। I think I should now take...

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN: Madam, it is very embarrassing that the Secretary-General cannot answer.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE): She has already answered the House by getting up from her chair and doing *namaskar* to everybody.

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN: She is also graceful.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE): She has been graceful throughout and she has done her job very well. May I take up the Question Hour now? Question No. 41.

ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

Danger to Environment and Marine Life

*41. SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES: Will the Minister of ENVIRONMENT AND FORESTS be pleased to state:

(a) whether it is a fact that the Ministry of Surface Transport have permitted the breaking of some old ships at Gujarat Ship-breaking Yard, which contains some toxic products which would pose a great danger to the environment and marine life in the country;

(b) if so, the details thereof and from where these ships are being procured; and

(c) whether the ship-breaking industry will be banned in the country as it poses a great hazard to the environment?

THE MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND FORESTS (PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ): (a) to (c) A statement is laid on the Table of the House.

Statement

(a) and (b) No, Sir. The Ministry of Surface Transport has not issued any approval for ship-breaking at Gujarat Ship-breaking Yard. The Gujarat Maritime Board constituted under the Gujarat Maritime Board Act, 1981 grants permission for beaching of ships while permission for cutting is granted by the local Port Authority. As per information made available by the Gujarat Ship Breakers Association, ships have been imported from various countries including China, France, Italy, Russia, Spain, Singapore, United Kingdom, United States of America, etc.

According to a recent study instituted by the Ministry of Steel on a suggestion by the Ministry of Environment and Forests, conducted through Metallurgical and Engineering Consultants (MECON), ships procured for breaking may contain toxic chemicals like lead, heavy metals, polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs), asbestos, tin, etc., in paints/components. According to the study, water pollutants generated during ship-breaking results in some changes in water quality and marine eco-system especially in the inter-tidal zone. The impact on the marine life can be minimised through Environmental Management Planning for disposal of solid waste, oil and oil sludge, house keeping, green belt development and post project environmental monitoring. The MECON study has also concluded that PCBs in water samples in the study area (Ship-breaking area, Alang, Gujarat) were below detectable limits. As per the study, the air pollution is insignificant,

and the ground water and surface water does not get contaminated by ship-breaking activity.

(c) The above mentioned MECON study has established that there is no significant hazard to the environment from ship-breaking. The Gujarat Maritime Board have informed that before permission for cutting is granted, certification from the Chief Controller of Explosives is required. The fuel tank of the vessel is emptied before cutting commences. A regulatory regime is already in place for ensuring that hazardous substances and hazardous wastes do not enter the country illegally. The Ministry of Environment and Forests also proposes to issue guidelines through the Central Pollution Control Board to the State Pollution Control Boards for ensuring Environmental Management Plans for disposal of solid waste, oil and oil sludge and other wastes to prevent damage to the environment from ship-breaking activity. There is at present no proposal to ban ship-breaking in the country.

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES: Madam, before I put my supplementary, on 23rd I read a report attributed to the hon. Prime Minister saying that the powers of the Ministry of Environment and forests are withdrawn, *vis-a-vis* the CRZ, Coastal Regulation Zone, and given to the Ministry of Surface Transport. I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether it is a fact or whether it is just a press report.

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: Madam, I have not come across any statement...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE): No, He has not completed his supplementary.

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: No, he wants clarifications. Madam, I have never come across any statement made by the hon. Prime Minister that the authority that vests with my Ministry has been given to the Ministry of Surface Transport. The Surface Transport Ministry is not concerned at all. This is the authority of my Ministry.

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES: Anyway, I was referring to Press reports. Madam, the hon. Minister has acceded in his lengthy reply saying that the ship-breaking industry causes pollution. Madam, what is sad to note is that the authority is given to the Gujarat Maritime Board and the local Port Authority. Madam, pollution created on the banks of the Indian Ocean in Gujarat is not restricted to the State of Gujarat. It flows down to other states which include Maharashtra, Goa, Karnataka and it may also go to other foreign neighbouring countries also. Madam, I want to know from the hon. Minister as to why he has kept the jurisdiction of the State Government to issue licences and whether environmental hazardous are caused only to the State, not to rest of the country. I would also like to know whether he would see to it that the powers of the State Government are withdrawn and taken over by the Ministry of Environment as a nodal Ministry.

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: Madam, ship-breaking activity is an industrial activity. So some Ministry has to be in charge of that. So it is the Ministry of steel which is in charge of ship-breaking activity and Gujarat has its own authority in respect of beaching scrapped parts. So that authority they will exercise. There are some major ports, there are some minor ports. This port is a minor port and Gujarat Government has the authority to beach the ship and involve the people in that kind of activity. Our Ministry's job basically is to look after the environment and that we are doing. There is a State Pollution Control Board. We have an Act on environment and we have laws on these hazardous substances. Wherever hazardous substances pollute the environment, we have vested the State Pollution Control Boards with the authority. They can stop any activity. But under the Act these minor ports have the authority to operate. Whenever it comes to our notice that hazardous substances are getting in, we shall take action and

we have taken action in certain fields. As far as the question of shipbreaking is concerned, it is not the concern of my Ministry. The concern of my Ministry is limited to eradication of pollution and protection of environment. That we are doing.

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES: Madam, it is common practice of the Government to pass the buck from one to another.

In the second part of the Minister's reply, he has concerned that the Ministry of Steel and Mines has conducted a study on the request of the Ministry of Environment and Forests. The Metallurgical and Engineering Consultants, *i.e.* MECON, has conducted a study as to whether shipbreaking is resulting in the release of some hazardous metals and other things which are going to be very harmful and capable of destroying the marine life. I want to know when this report was submitted to the Government and what action the Government has taken to see that the recommendations of MECON are implemented by the State Governments.

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: Madam, we requested the Ministry of steel to undertake a study because some hazardous substances like lead, paints, could be released when ships were broken. So, it was at the initiative of my Ministry that the Ministry of Steel instituted a survey to be conducted by MECON. The report which MECON submitted was an interim report. We received it only very recently. This report has gone into this question and the conclusion of the interim report is that if we implement the environmental laws, there is no question of any hazardous substances coming into India. They went from one ship to another when they were being broken. So, there is no question of any pollution. We have further told them to complete the sürvey and send to us the full report so that we can ask our experts to see and suggest whether there is any need for further action. If they suggest some action, it will be taken.

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES: Madam, recently...(*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (KUMARI SAROJ KHAPARDE): Mr. Fernandes, you have already put two supplementaries.

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES: Madam, this is my second supplementary. The first one was a clarification. It was not a supplementary. Madam, the hon. Supreme Court was kind enough to give a judgement which directed the Government to constitute an Environment Regulatory Authority. Any matter which relates to environment has to be referred to that Authority. May I know from the hon. Minister whether it is mandatory for the shipbreaking industry to obtain prior sanction from this Authority and whether the Central Port Trust at Paradeep has applied for such a licence because they started this lucrative business? This industry is banned in other countries because they consider India to be a dust bin. I request the hon. Ministry to clarify whether permission of the Environment Regulatory Authority is mandatory.

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: Madam, before the hon. Supreme Court's orders, the hon. Delhi High Court had also passed an order. The hon. Supreme Court's concern in this field has been responded to very positively. The institution which the hon. Member has referred to is the Environment Appellate Authority. It is my pleasure to inform this august House that we have succeeded—instituting these bodies is difficult—in instituting the National Environment Appellate Authority under the chairmanship of a retired Judge of the Supreme Court with three experienced Members. Now, any order passed by the Environment Minister is subject to appeal before that Authority and nobody can go in appeal to the High Court or the Supreme Court. This was done because this Authority would be

very quick to redress the grievances. It will not take much time. It will not sit only in Delhi. Any citizen of India, if he has a grievance in respect of environment or if any of my orders has an impact on the environment either directly or indirectly, can go before this Authority with his grievance and get redressal of his grievance from this Authority. This Authority has been instituted in response to the concern expressed by the hon. Supreme Court. We have also written to all the States that we shall not allow India to be a dumping ground for any hazardous substances. That concern of the hon. Supreme Court has been responded to very positively. I can assure this House that this has already been done. Whenever any state goes wrong, if we get such information, we will respond to it suitably. It was at our initiative that MECON had undertaken the study. As far as the misunderstanding regarding involvement of the Ministry of Transport is concerned, to the best of my knowledge, that ministry is not at all involved in this issue.

SHRI MANMOHAN SINGH: Madam, the hon. Minister has referred to the State Pollution Control Boards. I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether he is aware that there are a large number of complaints about the functioning of the state Pollution Control Boards, including severe charges of corruption, are being filed by the environmental workers. If it is so, what is the Minister proposing to do about them?

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: The hon. Member's concern for effective functioning of the State Pollution Control Boards is well taken. But these Boards have to work under the directions of the respective State Governments. We cannot directly intervene. But wherever there are complaints, the Central Pollution Control Board intervenes. It persuades them; it writes letters to them; sometimes it also issues directions. But the issue relates to the broader question of corruption. We can have a debate on corruption, including cases of corruption relating to pollution control boards. As far as the Central Pollution Control Board is concerned, my Ministry is directly responsible. May be there is corruption. We have taken certain steps. Very shortly I will have the privilege to take this august House into confidence when I place a document on the present status of pollution in Delhi for the consideration of the House. I will first present this status paper and then I will present an action plan which is being prepared in consultation with the Delhi Government. Corruption in State Pollution Control Boards is a subject which we have to discuss and understand. For that, there has to be a debate. As far as the Central Pollution Control Board is concerned, I am trying my best to keep it in proper shape. At the moment, I cannot just take a position that things have gone wrong. I have yet to see if the things have gone wrong or if people have indulged in corrupt practices. The hon. Member, Shri Manmohan Singh, is an eminent citizen of this country and an hon. Member of this House. If he has any particular case or complaint, he may kindly write to me. I will look into that and get back to him.

श्री राघवजी : माननीय मंत्री जी ने अपने उत्तर में यह कहा है कि उनके मंत्रालय ने सुझाव दिया था स्टील मिनिस्ट्री को एक सर्वे कंडक्ट करने के लिए और वह मेकान ने कंडक्ट किया है। मेकान मेनली इंजीनियरिंग कंसलटेंट्स हैं। पर्यावरण से शायद सीधा उनका संबंध नहीं आता है जबकि आपका विभाग पर्यावरण को ही डील करता है। मैं मंत्री जी से यह जानना चाहता हूं कि क्या आपके मंत्रालय में ऐसा कोई सेल है जो इस प्रकार के मामलों का अध्ययन करता है और उसके बारे में कोई रिपोर्ट तैयार करके रखी है और यह जो आप गाइडलाइन इश्यू करने वाले हैं वह क्या मेकान की रिपोर्ट पर से करेंगे या आपका पर्यावरण कंट्रोल बोर्ड जो है उनके द्वारा की गयी स्टडी से गाइडलाइन जारी करेंगे और कब तक ये गाइडलाइन जारी करने वाले हैं?

प्रो॰ सैफुद्दीन सोज़: मैंने यह अर्ज किया है कि यह जो काम है यह स्टील मिनिस्ट्री का है और चूंकि पर्यावरण को ठीक रखना हमारी जिम्मेदारी है इसलिए

हमने स्टील मिनिस्ट्री को सुझाव दिया कि वे देखें कि किसी तरह से हमारे पोर्टस के अंदर कोई हैजारडस ऐसा मवाद न आ जाए जिससे हमारा पर्यावरण ख़राब हो जाए। इसलिए सर्वे की गयी। सर्वे की इंटरिम रिपोर्ट आ गयी है। सर्वे मुकम्मल करके रिपोर्ट आ जाएगी। जहां तक गाइड लाइन का ताल्लुक है। हमारी गाइडलाइंस बनी हुई है। हमारा पर्यावरण का जो कानून है, अगर आप अथारिटी के रूप में देखेंगे तो हमारे पास अथारिटी काफी है। अभी पाल्यूशन के सिलसिले में हमने फैसला लिया है जब हम गंगा की बात कर रहे थे कि कैसे रोकेंगे। वजीर आजम ने जो नेशनल रिवर कंसलटेटिव अथारिटी है उसकी सदारत की। उसमें यह फैसला हुआ है कि दो हफ्ते जो गुजरने वाले हैं कल, उन दो हफ्तों में हम सर्वे करेंगे उसके बाद हमारे भारत की किसी भी दरिया में गंगा समेत या किसी झील में सीधे कोई पाल्यूटेंट्स जाते हैं इंडस्ट्रीज से तो उनको तीन महीने का नोटिस मिलेगा बंद करने के लिए। अगर तीन महीने के अंदर उन्होंने नहीं किया तो 90 दिन में उस इंडस्ट्री को मैं बंद करूंगा। यह कानून इस मिनिस्ट्री ने बनाया हुआ है। इसमें मुझे किसी और मंत्रालय से कोई सलाह-मशविरा नहीं करना है। हमने एक नोटिस तैयार किया है, कल या परसों तक यह सर्वे का काम मुकम्मल हो जाएगा और फिर 90 दिन का नोटिस उन सारी जगहों को मिलेगा। इस वक्त ऑल इंडिया लेवल पर सर्वे हो रहा है, तमाम पोल्यूशन कंट्रोल बोर्ड्ज़ को इस सिलसिले में चिट्ठियां गई हैं और चीफ-मिनिस्टर्स को भी बताया गया है ताकि बाद में कोई शिकायत न हो। इस सर्वे के बाद हमें पता चलेगा कि ऐसी कितनी इंडस्ट्रीज़ हैं। काफी समय उनको मिला है। अब तक उनको अपने ऐफ्लुऐंट्स को ट्रीट करना चाहिये था और हम इस बारे में उनको सलाह-मशविरा और जानकारी भी दे सकते थे। जिन लोगों ने अभी तक यह काम नहीं किया है, 90 दिनों में उनका कारखाना बंद हो जाएगा। यह नोटिस कल या परसों जाने वाला है। आपको उसकी चिंता है, यह मैं समझ सकता हूं।

प्रो॰ राम कापसे: सवाल जो पूछा गया था वह यह था कि मैकन कंपनी तो इंजीनियरिंग कंपनी है, यह पोल्यूशन के विषय में ऐक्सपर्ट नहीं है। इस विषय में आपने कुछ नहीं कहा है।

प्रो॰ सैफुद्दीन सोज: मुअज़्ज़िज़ मेंबर की जानकारी सही नहीं है। यह एक बहुत बड़ी कंपनी है, रेप्यूटेड कंपनी है। इसमें इंजीनियरिंग ऐक्सपर्टस भी हैं और ऐनवॉयरनमेंटलिस्ट्स भी हैं। उन्होंने जो किया है वह सही किया है और उस कंपनी को पूरी जानकारी है पयावरण के बारे में। इस बारे में चिंता करने की जरूरत नहीं है।

[ ]Transliteration in Arabic Script.

پروفیسر رام کاپسے: سوال جو پوچھا گیا تھا وہ یہ تھا کہ "میکن کمپنی" تو انجینئرنگ کمپنی ہے یہ پولیوشن کے وشے میں ایکسپرٹ نہیں ہیں۔ اس وشے میں آپ نے کچھ نہیں کہا ہے۔

پروفیسر سیف الدین سوز: معزز ممبر کی جانکاری صحیح نہیں ہے یہ ایک بہت بڑی کمپنی ہے "ریپوٹیشن کمپنی" ہے اسمیں انجینئرنگ ایکسپرٹس بھی ہیں اور انوائرنمنٹلسٹ بھی ہیں انھوں نے جو کیا ہے وہ صحیح کیا ہے اور اس کمپنی کو پوری جانکاری ہے پریاورن کے بارے میں۔ اس بارے میں چنتا کرنے کی ضرورت نہیں ہے۔

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE. My question has nexus with the answer he gave about constituting an authority which will sit in judgment over the decisions taken by them. Madam, the question I am putting is of equal interest to you. In Vidarbha, there are large areas. As an imperial legacy, those areas are described as *jhurpi* jungle, bush forests. *Jhurpi* jungle means, they ae neither bushes nor forests. It is an imperial legacy, they have so described it for years. We complained to the Minister that as a result of this misnomer, our development is affected adversely. Will you please rectify the entire matter? Ministers after Ministers promised remedial measures, nothing has come through, Madam. May I ask of the Minister if he will look into this?

کسی جھیل میں سیدھے کوئی "پولیوشن" جاتے ہیں انڈسٹریز سے تو انکو تین مہینے کا نوٹس ملے گا بند کرنے کیلئے۔ اگر تین مہینہ کے اندر انھوں نے نہیں کیا تو ۹۰ دن میں اس انڈسٹریز کو میں بند کروانا یہ قانون اس منسٹری سے بنایا ہوا ہے۔ اسمیں مجھے کسی اور منسٹریہ سے صلاح مشورہ نہیں کرنا ہے۔ ہم نے ایک نوٹس تیار کیا ہے۔ کل یا پرسوں تک یہ سروے کا کام مکمل ہو جائے گا اور پھر ۹۰ دن کا نوٹس ان ساری جگہوں کو ملے گا۔ اسوقت آل انڈیا لیول پر سروے ہو رہا ہے۔ تمام "پولیوشن کنٹرول بورڈس" کو اس سلسلے میں چٹھیاں گئی ہیں اور چیف منسٹر کو بھی بتایا گیا ہے تاکہ بعد میں کوئی شکایت نہ ہو۔ اس سروے کے بعد ہمیں پتہ چلے گا کہ ایسی کتنی انڈسٹریز ہیں۔ کافی ہمیں انکو ملا ہے اب تک انکو اپنے انفلوئنس کو کریٹ کرنا چاہیے تھا اور ہم اس بارے میں انکو صلاح مشورہ اور جانکاری بھی دے سکتے تھے۔ جن لوگوں نے ابھی تک یہ کام نہیں کیا ہے۔ ۹۰ دنوں میں انکا کارخانہ بند ہو جائیگا۔ یہ نوٹس کل یا پرسوں جانے والا ہے۔ آپکو اسکی چنتا ہے میں یہ سمجھ سکتا ہوں۔

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: Certainly, I will look into this because this has been raised now. I will go into it and keep you informed.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Will the appellate authority sit in judgment over the injustice you have been doing to us, to the Vidarbha region?

PROF. SAIFUDDIN SOZ: Any citizen can approach the Authority and the Authority's decisions will be final because that Authority will make my Ministry transparent. I have accepted that with all humility and all sense of responsibility. The concern for all kinds of conservation that is inthe interest of our nation, will be answered. If you kindly take up this matter with me, I would love to get back to you with full details. I join you on the issue over which you have shown concern.

डा० कर्ण सिंह: महोदया, हमारी संस्कृति में गंगा सबसे पवित्र और स्वच्छ नदी मानी जाती थी और अब भी मानी जाती है लेकिन गंगा मे बड़ा भयंकर प्रदूषण हो रहा है। कई वर्ष पहले श्री राजीव गांधी के समय में गंगा को स्वच्छ करने का प्लान बनाया गया था और करोड़ों रुपए इसके लिए रखे गये थे लेकिन मेरी जारीकारी के अनुसार उससे कोई अंतर नहीं पड़ा है और गंगा में प्रदूषण अभी तक वैसे का वैसा चल रहा है। तो क्या मंत्री महोदय इस संबंध में हमें कोई आश्वासन देंगे कि गंगा के प्रदूषण की ओर विशेष ध्यान दिया जाएगा?

प्रो० सैफउद्दीन सोज: वैसे तो हमारे यहां बहुत सारे दरिया हैं और सभी दरिया पवित्र कहलाए जा सकते हैं लेकिन गंगा की अहमियत सारे देश के लिए है और हमारी तहज़ीब को गंगा-जमुनी तहज़ीब कहा जाता है। मैंने अपना कार्यभार संभालते ही सबसे पहले गंगा की तरफ तवज्जह दी है। उस ज़माने में इस पर बड़ी चर्चा हो रही थी और मुझे बताते हुए खुशी है कि नेशनल कंजरवेशन बोर्ड में गंगा पहला विषय था और उसमे अब तक लगभग 500 करोड़ रुपए का खर्च हुआ है, वह खर्चा हम जाया नहीं होने देंगे और गंगा के बारे में हम विशेष प्रोग्राम चलाएंगे।

बल्कि यू०पी०, बिहार, वेस्ट बंगाल और हरियाणा ने यह कहा कि शेयरिंग मत मांगिए हमको हंड्रेड परसेंट दे दीजिए। I went to the Planning Commission; I went to hon. Prime Minister. Under hon. Prime Minister's chairmanship we held a meeting of the National River Conservation Authority and we decided to give States a hundred per cent funding. But we have requested them, and I am repeating my request, that they must give a helping hand to make the Ganga project a success.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE): Thank you, Mr. Minister, the Question Hour is over.

WRITTEN ANSWERS TO STARRED QUESTIONS

Issuance of metal passes to the Members of the Railway Board

*42. SHRI VEDPRAKASH P. GOYAL: Will the Minister of RAILWAYS be pleased to state:

(a) whether any system of issuing metal passes to Members of the Railway Board or others is in vogue in the Indian Railways;

(b) whether it is a fact that 6000 such passes have been issued during the year 1996-97;

(c) what is the difference between metal and other free passes;

(d) since when the system is in existence in the Railways and the Criteria fixed for issuing such passes;

(e) whether such passes are also issued to the families of the Railway Board Members;

(f) if so, on what terms and conditions and justifications therefore; and

(g) whether these passes remain valid even after their retirement?

THE MINISTER OF RAILWAYS (SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN): (a) Yes, Sir. Metal Passes are duty passes and they are issued to Railway officers for performing journey on duty.

(b) No, Sir.